AZIMUTH

Philosophical Coordinates in Modern and Contemporary Age

XII (2024), nr. 24

Critical Care

edited by
Jocelyn Olcott – Tania Rispoli

InSchibboleth

ABSTRACTS

KELLY DOMBROSKI, COMMUNITIES OF CARE IN THE NITTY-GRITTY OF COMMONS-WORK

Abstract: What does it mean to create a community of care? Care scholars have identified the importance of thinking about care not only as individualised labour but as the basis for reciprocal and interdependent communities of care. The 'nitty-gritty' of care is rarely idyllic, and involves difficult collaborations and relationships with others. Indeed, it is in the nitty-gritty negotiation of the details of care that a community of care is constituted. In this paper, I argue that it is in the shared work of caring for commons, or 'commoning' that a community is constituted, although there are tensions in working out how to do this practically. This paper explores two core tensions: the tension between the openness and boundedness of communities of care, and the tension between the affective dimensions of care and the labour dimensions of care. The argument of the paper will be grounded in key examples from empirical research with two commoning communities in Aotearoa New Zealand: a community economies action group in low-income Porirua, and a trust and associated artist partners that organise temporary use of urban Christchurch sites for community wellbeing projects.

Keywords: care, communing, affect, labour, community, New Zealand

KELLY SAUNDERS, IMAGINING HOPED-FOR FUTURES OF EVERYDAY CARE: GENERATING THE OTHERWISE

Abstract: The gendered work and burden of care are well established in care studies and there are good reasons why scholars do not focus on the joys of care in the present day. But in a global crisis of care, there is a desperate need to engage in 'care futurity', which is to imagine care's possibilities. Using data from participant interviews and creative vignette writing in Australia, this paper seeks to fill a futures gap in empirical care scholarship, focused on 'everyday' care. I argue that futuring care 'generates culture' by doing four things. First, it builds visions of care that are boldly and necessarily excessive – making time to share care and infrastructures that need to exist, disrupting market logics and bureaucracy that close care down. Second, through futuring, care networks emerge that implicate new actors in shared responsibility for care. Third, this kind of futuring permits a different conversation, focused on care's transgressive possibilities, challenging structural binaries of work/care, public/private and irresponsible/responsible. Finally, futuring care can change the people involved. Imagining everyday care emboldens care scholarship, supporting convivial and expansive forms of care that push against the unfair, ambivalent present. It reorientates us toward desirable futures, creating alternative starting points for care studies and practices.

Keywords: feminist futures, care futurity, everyday care, imagination, shared care

LIBBIE RIFKIN, “THIS IS A LIVING DOCUMENT”. READING ACT UP PHILADELPHIA’S SOCIAL POETICS OF CARE

Abstract: This article explores ACT UP Philadelphia’s structures of care through a close analysis the materials surrounding activist Kiyoshi Kuromiya’s death as well as the convergence of activist traditions that shaped his life and legacy. A veteran of the Civil Rights and anti-war movements, Kuromiya co-founded ACT UP Philly in 1988 and launched its groundbreaking patient-centered Standard of Care, which was revised at least 15 times throughout the 1990s. In 1989, Kuromiya created the Critical Path Project, a 24/7 support hotline and Bulletin Board System (BBS) committed to sharing the latest research and clinical trial opportunities. Kuromiya was an early adopter of online technologies, often remediating them in print form to reach across the digital divide. In his development of multimodal strategies for interpreting and disseminating life-saving information, he was an early practitioner of what we now call Universal Design for Learning (UDL). Engaging with the archive of the Standard of Care and the Critical Path Project alongside evidence of intimate, collective practices of care like the remarkable notes his comrades kept in the hospital as he was dying, this article argues that ACT UP Philadelphia’s unique combination of mutual aid and UDL draws on the legacy of Black feminist and queer kinship traditions, re-making them for a digital age and presaging the work of contemporary disability communities surviving the pandemic.

Keywords: care, poetics, HIV/AIDS, disability, activism

SHELLEY M. PARK, E-CARITY: THE ENTANGLEMENT OF CARE AND PRECARITY UNDER TECHNOCAPITALISM

Abstract: Digital technologies pervade 21st century landscapes of care from healthcare to childcare, simultaneously responding to and recreating precarity. This paper forwards the notion of ‘e-carity’ to highlight the entanglements of care and precarity under technocapitalism. Focusing on three areas of technologically mediated care – childcare, eldercare, and companionship – I unpack some of the ideological, material, and affective dimensions of technologically delivered care that address and yet extend precarity.

Keywords: care, care crisis, precarity, technology, technosolutionism, technoprecarity, technocapitalism

MADDALENA FRAGNITO, DISMANTLING PRODUCTIVITY BIT BY BIT: HACKING DIGITAL PLATFORMS FOR MORE LIVABLE LIVES

Abstract: This article explores the tactics, tools, and imaginaries of the *PostWork Group* (PWG), an anonymous organization that lives in a highly impoverished area of Southern Europe. Through a collective assembly-like discussion, I analyze how this group hacks Spotify’s user views to provide a basic income to participants and to support collective projects aimed at enhancing the living conditions of their surrounding and communities. By engaging in various material interactions, the

PWG encompasses transformative processes of subjectivation that question care organization under capitalism as well as the fundamental nature of productive labor. The PWG organization contests concepts such as individualism, competition, constant availability, and hyper-productive values, thereby undermining the foundational principles on which the capitalist system relies. On the one hand, this article analyzes how acts of *hacking with care* can transcend care boundaries of proximity and distance by engaging with embodied realities, ecological contexts, and technological realms. On the other, the article analyzes how reorganizing and rethinking care provisions inevitably implies rethinking the so-called *productive sphere*. This *nexus* reveals the fact that questioning care is not 'just' an issue of revaluing the unvalued labor that sustains life, but a matter of revaluing value overall, a process contributing to the transformation of the world *bit by bit*.

Keywords: collective care, hacking, platform economy

ANNE DUBOS, GESTURES OF CARE. THE INVISIBLE POWER OF MOTHERING LOVE

Abstract: Since I became a mother of twins, I have been interested in analyzing gestures as the smallest unit of measurement of Care. Exhausted by my intensive maternal life, as an anthropologist and a choreographer, I nevertheless have found myself fascinated by the nature of the circle of care generated by mothering: What kind of gestures does a young mother have to perform in order to care for her babies? While gestures of care can be described and analyzed as the first foundational elements of the value of maternal love, the notion of "techniques of the body" will help build the concept of mothering as an *efficient apparatus of care*. For that purpose, I will use the methodological tool of a *Gestothèque* (a library for gestures), where the effort of categorization and taxonomy of gestures helps revealing the "invisible" parts of the act of caring. My contribution will focus on the notion of *attention* and *awareness* in an attempt to open up new perspectives on the concept of *apparatus*.

Keywords: mothering, care, apparatus, technique of the body, orthopraxy, gestothèque

SHAUN RESPESS, RESPONSIVENESS TO RESENTMENT: PSYCHIATRIC CAR EAND THE PROBLEM OF ETHICAL LONELINESS

Abstract: The Open Paradigm Project is an initiative devoted to sharing the stories of persons who have been harmed and/or disserved while receiving psychiatric care. In these first-person accounts, participants detail their grief, disdain, anger, apprehension, and frustration as they reflect on their treatment experiences. This article argues that they possess legitimate claims of 'resentment' that warrant acknowledgment and reparation, as evidenced by the insufficient credibility of experts and coercive regulation of atypical patients. Moreover, it contends that biomedicalization, which is not only an empirical process but a moral discourse, unjustifiably nullifies the testimonies of subjected patients and thus perpetuates epistemic injustices as well as physical injuries. I implement a critical ethics of care to consider the normative conditions of responsiveness while also evaluating ongoing problems like 'ethical loneliness' and 'medical gaslighting.' As illustrated in The Open Paradigm Project, certain paradigms of care can be used to sustain marginalization by blurring the boundaries

of treatment, fostering abandonment, and dismissing critiques of authority. These are keen lessons that apply far beyond the scope of psychiatric settings.

Keywords: resentment, responsiveness, biomedicalization, ethical loneliness, ethics of care, medical gaslighting, medical anthropology

RIIKKA PRATTES, ATTENTIVENESS AND RESPONSIVENESS IN PRIVILEGED MEN'S PRACTICES OF SOCIAL REPRODUCTION

Abstract: This article emphasizes how attentiveness and responsiveness – two central yet undervalued skills of care work – are not only part of care work but emerge out of its practice. By investigating men's attentive and responsive practices, the article outlines how these embodied skills are potential loci out of which a different politics of social reproduction could emerge. Contrary to most scholarship on the international division of reproductive labor (IDRL) which engages with the disproportionate amounts of caring labor that women and marginalized people provide, the article engages with the (limited) care work performed by structurally privileged men based in Vienna, Austria, who pay for domestic cleaning services in the IDRL. Maintaining that these men's domestic practices not only highlight a key locus where unjust global care chains take their starting point, but also where futures otherwise could emerge, the argument unfolds in three steps. First, the lack of appreciation for care work, especially 'mundane' cleaning work is outlined; an unequal distribution of attentiveness that is coupled with this disregard is discussed via excerpts from an empirical study. Second, the article moves to highlight nascent skills of attentiveness and responsiveness that were found in that study, among a group of men who engage minimally in social reproduction. Finally, the article zeroes in on "glimmers" of futures otherwise that are also evident in the research. That is: potentials for transformation away from the current, gendered, and racialized organization of social reproduction.

Keywords: attentiveness, responsiveness, everyday practice, international division of reproductive labor, critical studies of men and masculinities

PEDRO AUGUSTO GRAVATÁ NICOLI – MARCELO MACIEL RAMOS, QUEER CARE. THINKING CARE FROM LIFE HISTORIES OF LGBTQIA+ ELDERS IN BRAZIL

Abstract: How do LGBTQIA+ people experience care? Are they somehow deprived of it because they are LGBTQIA+? Do they receive or provide care in any way that is different because of who they are? And, in the process of deprivation or violence of heterociscentred arrangements, do they reconstitute relational care practices and arrangements based on the experiences of discrimination and vulnerabilities they go through? How so? In this article we intend to demonstrate that dissident expressions of gender and sexuality have an intense influence on the ways in which LGBTQIA+ people access or fail to access care throughout their lives. Their gender identities and sexualities are strong elements in everything that concerns care. Even in the definition of what it is. This text seeks to understand this complex design, proposing the idea of queer care, based on empirical data from a

project entitled Longeviver LGBT+, which investigates the aging processes of this population in Belo Horizonte, Minas Gerais, Brazil. And it does so based mainly on life history interviews carried out with 75 LGBTQIA+ elderly people. With these people, we want to understand how their identities affect the very substance of care, in its practices, subjects, relationships and spaces.

Keywords: care, queer care, LGBTQIA+ life histories, LGBTQIA+ aging

INÉS PÉREZ, SEGMENTACIÓN DEL TRABAJO DEL HOGAR: CUIDADO Y TRABAJO DOMÉSTICO EN LA ARGENTINA DURANTE LA PANDEMIA DE COVID-19

Abstract: A new division has begun to emerge among domestic workers in Argentina in recent times, distinguishing those whose main responsibility is care work from those who perform domestic work (such as cleaning, cooking, shopping). This article addresses this segmentation process from a historical perspective. First, it analyzes how "private household work" – trabajo en casas particulares – was legally constructed and the rights guaranteed to it in the mid-twentieth century, as well as the processes of scission and hierarchization that it implied. Secondly, we characterize the current working conditions of this sector, highlighting the differentiation that is taking place between those who perform domestic and care work. Finally, it examines the strategies of home care workers to hierarchize their work and compares them with those developed by other domestic workers in the first half of the twentieth century. The article concludes with a question about the impact that the process of delegitimization of labor rights and the change in the political climate that crystallized in the country at the end of 2023 may have on the working conditions and political strategies of domestic and care workers.

Keywords: domestic work, home care, segmentation, labor rights, gender

MICHAEL O'HARA – CONNELL VAUGHAN, THE POLITICS OF CARE: RANCIÈRE'S AESTHETICS AND THE CRITIQUE OF THE MUSEUM

Abstract: While the concept of care has predominantly been conceived in terms of ethics and politics in recent literature, the politics of care at the heart of aesthetics has been absent from this turn. Accordingly, we ask: what does Jacques Rancière's aesthetics reveal about care in the museum context? Our approach to this question is informed by a recognition of the changing role of the museum as a site of social construction, aesthetics, and care, and utilises Rancière's writing concerning the politics of aesthetics. The article proceeds through an account of the ethics and politics of care and the historical development of the museum as a site of care. It then considers intersecting contemporary critiques of the museum, namely: "postcolonial", "institutional critique", "socially engaged art practice", and "new institutionalism". From this analysis, the paper turns to critical care practices such as "curatorial care", as potential examples of Rancièrian *dissensus*, to argue that the site of the museum has an inherent politics and is continually contested by curatorial and artistic practice.

Keywords: Jacques Rancière, politics of care, *Dissensus*, museum, curation, aesthetics

AARON HAMMES, NARRATIVIZING SEX WORK COMMUNITIES OF CARE

Abstract: This study tracks communities of care in the face of criminalization and stigmatization within long form contemporary fiction centered on the sex trades. I contend that narrative construction is central to the emotional labor of sex work, which is translated into care work within and across communities of sex working subjects. The four novels in this study center on the most marginalized and sex-gendered, racialized, underclassed, and, broadly, minoritized workers in order to track various strategies for narrativizing and recontextualizing care relationships both inward- and outward-focused. In contouring and classifying these communities of care, I argue for both latent and expressed radical potentialities of the stories stigmatized subjects tell about their work, identities, and relationships, as well as utopian prospects for better worlds for sex workers and their communities.

Keywords: sex work, transgender studies, novel, care work, emotional labor

ELLIE CLEASBY – KIM ENGLAND, ARING, MENDING, CLEANING: IMAGINING MORE JUST COMMUNITIES OF CARE THROUGH THE DOMESTIC WORKERS COALITION AND KANTAMANTO MARKET

Abstract: Responsibilities for providing care are unevenly dispersed geographically, and often along racialized and gendered lines. Expanding market relations, associated with neoliberalism, facilitate globalization and create complex webs of care, while simultaneously embedding labor in a logic of disposability. Using examples of Seattle's Domestic Workers Coalition and Kantamanto in Accra, Ghana, one of the largest secondhand clothing markets in the world, we explore the ways that workers resist the devaluation and disposability that occur within their webs of care. This agency is highlighted when the bodies of literature around care ethics, communities of care and commoning are read as a framework for understanding these workers' current situations. We employ critical care ethics in response to counter the disposability and devaluing that have occurred under neoliberal capitalism. Communities of care highlight the role of relationality and worker activism in resisting the dispos-session and devaluation that take place within their webs of care. Finally, incorporating commoning, a sustainability literature, we imagine communities of care which show that our interdependence and existence in networks of care are central to the human condition and pivotal to both survival and flourishing.

Keywords: critical care ethics, webs of care, USA, Ghana, devaluation